UNIVERSITY OF AMSTERDAM

UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Commercial and residential real estate market liquidity

van Dijk, D.W.

Link to publication

Creative Commons License (see https://creativecommons.org/use-remix/cc-licenses):
Other

Citation for published version (APA):
van Dijk, D. W. (2019). *Commercial and residential real estate market liquidity*.

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UvA-DARE is a service provided by the library of the University of Amsterdam (http://dare.uva.nl)

Download date: 23 Nov 2020

This dissertation explores several issues regarding the role of market liquidity in real estate assets, in particular for the Dutch residential and U.S. commercial real estate markets. Three main topics are addressed throughout all chapters. The first topic concerns the development of new ways to measure real estate market liquidity. The second topic addresses the link between changes in market liquidity and price developments. The third topic focusses on how market liquidity can be used by policymakers and market participants to get a better grasp on real estate markets.

DORINTH VAN DIJK received his master's degree in Business Economics – Real Estate Finance & Finance from the University of Amsterdam in 2014 (cum laude). Dorinth won the "H.K. Nieuwenhuis Thesis Award" for his master's thesis. He subsequently started his PhD in finance at the University of Amsterdam in collaboration with De Nederlandsche Bank. In 2015, he won the "Best Paper Award" for his research at the International Real Estate summit in Washington D.C. During his PhD, Dorinth also worked as an economist at De Nederlandsche Bank and was a visiting researcher at the MIT Center for Real Estate for which he received the "UvA385 Lustrumbeurs" travel grant.

ISBN 978-94-92679-73-4

Commercial and residential real estate market liquidity Dorinth Willem van Dijk



Dorinth Willem van Dijk

Commercial and residential real estate market liquidity

Universiteit van Amsterdam

Commercial and residential real estate market liquidity

Universiteit van Amsterdam

Dorinth Willem van Dijk

COMMERCIAL AND RESIDENTIAL REAL ESTATE MARKET LIQUIDITY

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT
ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie, in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Aula der Universiteit
op vrijdag 1 februari 2019, te 13:00 uur
door Dorinth Willem van Dijk
geboren te Maastricht.

Promotiecommissie:

Promotoren:	
prof. dr. M.K. Francke	Universiteit van Amsterdam
prof. dr. J. de Haan	Rijksuniversiteit Groningen
Overige leden:	
prof. dr. J.M. Clapp	University of Connecticut
prof. dr. J.B.S. Conijn	Universiteit van Amsterdam
prof. dr. P.M.A. Eichholtz	Universiteit van Maastricht
dr. E. Eiling	Universiteit van Amsterdam
prof. dr. D.M. Geltner	Massachusetts Institute of Technology
prof. dr. P. van Gool	Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit Economie en Bedrijfskunde
Universiteit van Amsterdam

Contents

List of Tables **ix**

List of Figures **xi**

1 Introduction **1**
- 1.1 Market liquidity in real estate markets 2
- 1.2 How can real estate market liquidity be measured? 8
- 1.3 What is the relationship between prices and market liquidity in real estate markets? 9
- 1.4 How can market liquidity be used for a better understanding and monitoring of real estate markets? 11

2 Regional constant-quality housing market liquidity indices **13**
- 2.1 Introduction and motivation 14
- 2.2 Model and data 19
  - 2.2.1 Model 19
  - 2.2.2 Estimation 23
  - 2.2.3 Data 24
- 2.3 Market liquidity and risk 28
  - 2.3.1 Liquidity indices 28
  - 2.3.2 Commonality with transaction prices 31
  - 2.3.3 Liquidity risk 34
- 2.4 Determinants, decomposition, and robustness 35
  - 2.4.1 Determinants of the time on market 35
  - 2.4.2 Time-varying effect of list price premium 41

2.4.3 Decomposition of effects: the effect of quality and withdrawals . . . 43
2.4.4 Decomposition of effects: the effect of list price premium . . . 47
2.4.5 Revisions . . . 50
2.4.6 Correlated unobserved heterogeneity . . . 53
2.5 Conclusion . . . 55

3 Revisiting supply and demand indices in real estate 57
3.1 Introduction and Motivation . . . 58
3.2 Reservation Prices and Liquidity . . . 62
3.2.1 Model . . . 62
3.2.2 Estimation . . . 69
3.3 Data . . . 70
3.4 Results . . . 72
3.4.1 Probability of sale . . . 73
3.4.2 Repeat sales indices . . . 75
3.4.3 Supply and demand indices . . . 77
3.4.4 A recent anomaly? . . . 79
3.5 Conclusions . . . 80

4 Internet search behavior, liquidity, and prices in the housing market 83
4.1 Introduction . . . 84
4.2 Related literature . . . 87
4.2.1 Market liquidity . . . 87
4.2.2 Search and matching models . . . 87
4.2.3 Downpayment constraints . . . 88
4.2.4 Behavioral explanations . . . 88
4.3 Theoretical framework . . . 89
4.3.1 Market tightness and prices . . . 89
4.3.2 Market tightness and liquidity . . . 90
4.3.3 Temporal differences . . . 90
4.4 Data . . . 92
4.4.1 Transaction data . . . 92
4.4.2 Internet search data . . . 96
4.5 Empirical model . . . 98
4.6 Results . . . 99
4.6.1 Estimation results . . . 99

4.6.2 Impulse responses 101
4.7 Robustness checks 104
4.7.1 Earthquake area 104
4.7.2 Geographical variation in responsiveness 106
4.8 Conclusion 110

5 Conclusion and summary "Commercial and residential real estate market liquidity" 113
5.1 How can real estate market liquidity be measured? 114
5.2 What is the relationship between prices and market liquidity in real estate markets? 115
5.3 How can market liquidity be used for a better understanding and monitoring of real estate market? 117

Appendices 121

A Appendix for Chapter 2 123
A.1 Comparison with Carillo and Pope (2012) 123
A.2 Estimated transaction price at time of entry 127
A.3 Transaction prices indices 128

B Appendix for Chapter 4 131
B.1 Theoretical framework 131
B.2 House price index and rate of sale estimation 134

Bibliography 141

Nederlandse samenvatting (Summary in Dutch) 149

List of Co-Authors 155

Acknowledgments 157

List of Tables

2.1 Description of the three markets between 2005 and 2016. . 27
2.2 Estimates of the control variables for three different markets in two different models. 37
2.3 Summary statistics of revisions. 52
2.4 Posterior means and 95% HPD intervals for the factor loadings and standard deviations of the unobserved heterogeneity components. 53

3.1 Descriptive statistics of the two markets over the sample. 72
3.2 Coefficient estimates including 95% confidence intervals of the probit equation for the two markets over 2005Q1 and 2017Q2. 74
3.3 Coefficient estimates on the inverse Mills ratio ($\sigma_{\epsilon,\eta}$) in the repeat sales equations including the 95% HPD intervals and model statistics. 77

4.1 Overview of variables. 92
4.2 Descriptive statistics 2011 - 2013 per year. 94
4.3 Results of the combining p-value tests to test for a unit root in the specified variables. 96
4.4 Panel VAR regression results. 100
4.5 Panel VAR regression without earthquake areas. 105
4.6 Robustness check: Panel VAR regression results of urban areas and rural areas. 107

4.7 Robustness check: Panel VAR regression results with the sample split in two according to the average annualized returns. 109

A.1 Hedonic estimation of the coefficients on log transaction price. 128
A.2 Hedonic (HTM) estimation of the coefficients on log transaction price. 130

B.1 Summary statistics of HTM estimations of the price index. 137
B.2 Estimates of the coefficients of house characteristics on the log of transaction price in COROP region 23 (Amsterdam region). 138

List of Figures

1.1 Buyers' and sellers' reservation price distributions at different points in the cycle consistent with pro-cyclical liquidity. . . . 4
1.2 Cumulative distributions of buyers' and sellers' reservation prices. . . . 5
1.3 Pro-cyclical liquidity in a classical supply and demand diagram. . . . 5
1.4 Pro-cyclical liquidity in a Robinson Crusoe economy. . . . 7

2.1 Fraction of houses withdrawn over the cycle in the Amsterdam region, 2005-2016. . . . 16
2.2 Two constant-quality liquidity indices and an index of the mean TOM of sold properties, 2005-2016. . . . 30
2.3 Comparison of market liquidity (random walk indices) between the three markets, 2005-2016. . . . 31
2.4 Illiquidity (constant-quality and random walk, left axis) and transaction price (right axis) indices, 2005-2017. . . . 33
2.5 Comparison of market liquidity risk between the three markets, 2005-2016. . . . 34
2.6 Time-varying effect of list price premium and 95% HPD intervals (top panel) and the marginal effect (bottom panel) in the large market (Amsterdam), 2005-2016. . . . 42
2.7 Decomposition of effects. . . . 45
2.8 Difference in illiquidity due to quality. . . . 46
2.9 Illiquidity indices with and without list price premium, 2005-2016. . . . 48

2.10 Difference in illiquidity due to list price premium, 2005-2016. 49
2.11 Illiquidity indices with and without correlated unobserved heterogeneity, 2005-2016. 54

3.1 Buyers' and sellers' reservation price distributions at different points in the cycle consistent with pro-cyclical liquidity. 63
3.2 Raw and smoothed/seasonally adjusted estimates of the time fixed effects in the probit equation (γ_t) for the two markets over 2005Q1 and 2017Q2. 75
3.3 Repeat sales indices of commercial real estate in New York and Phoenix between 2005Q1 and 2017Q2. 76
3.4 Supply and demand indices in the New York City area. . 78
3.5 Supply and demand indices in the Phoenix area. 79
3.6 Buyers'and sellers' cumulative distribution of reservation prices in case of pro-cyclical liquidity. 80

4.1 Response of prices (B), matching probability (C) to a change in market tightness (A) in week 11. 91
4.2 Map that depicts the value of a standardized home within each municipality between 2011 and 2013. 95
4.3 Map that depicts the average number of clicks per house of each municipality between 2011 and 2013. 95
4.4 Impulse-response functions, impulse variable → response variable. 102
4.5 Cumulative impulse-response functions, impulse variable → response variable. 103

A.1 Comparison between constant-quality random walk indices and Carillo and Pope (2012). 126

B.1 Price indices (A), rate of sale (B) and clicks per house (C) of six municipalities within COROP region 23 (Amsterdam region). 139